A Legacy of Resistance & Stewardship

GIVING BLACK
CINCINNATI

DECEMBER 2018
$67,384
Median income of Black managers¹
($45k for nurses and teachers)

$10M
Nearly
In Donor Advise Funds in Greater Cincinnati
Philanthropic Organizations and Companies²

$38,539
Median Household income for all Cincinnatians⁴

9
Fortune 500 Companies³

33 years old
Median age of Black Cincinnatians⁵

44% Black Cincinnatian
The percentage of Cincinnati are Black

229 African American Businesses
in the African American Chamber of Commerce Directory serving Cincinnati and Northern Kentucky⁷

Source: Check all sources
¹ Data USA: Cincinnati, Ohio
² Giving Black Cincinnati, December 2018
³ Giving Black Cincinnati, December 2018
⁴ Giving Black Report, NEBiP
⁵ All-in Cincinnati, October 2018
Time for a New Narrative

21st Century philanthropy linked with a qualitative, interdisciplinary lens is leading us to a new narrative

A New Quantitative Outlook

A Linked Local View

Integrating Qualitative Research

Strong Collaboration and Support

Strengthening Leadership & Philanthropy

It Starts with Us

A new narrative that utilizes frameworks and approaches that:

Celebrate the assets and power of Black philanthropy through resistance, resiliency and renewal
It’s a New Landscape for Giving

Donors

- Old Economy Wealth
- New Economy Wealth: Finance and Tech Professionals
- Heirs / Transfer Wealth
- Women & People of Color

- 7 million Hispanics and African-Americans had a net worth of more than $500,000 in 2012
- Asian-Americans have the highest median income
- Nearly two-thirds of black households make charitable donations, worth a total of about $11 billion a year, the report said.
- 43% of the 75 million Millennials in the U.S. identify as African American, Hispanic or Asian

Behaviors

- Giving for Impact; Make a Difference
- Very Private; Opaque Intermediaries
- Rise in Collaboration and Affinity Giving

- Identity-based giving is gaining momentum in the Latino, Asian American, Arab American, and Native American communities
- Black Americans have produced the steadiest growth of new identity-based charitable funds over the last 4 decades of any racial or ethnic group
- Black donors give away 25 percent more of their incomes than white donors, according to a report released in October 2018 by the W.K. Kellogg Foundation and Rockefeller Philanthropy Advisors.

---

1 Source: Forbes; David Callahan, Inside Philanthropy
2 Source: Jackie Copeland-Carson, Chief Program and Operations Officer, Catholic Charities, Santa Clara County
4 Nielson Reports
Giving Black Cincinnati: Resistance

Giving Black is allows us to resist the negative narrative and view ourselves in relationship to our assets.

“Philanthropy = White, Male and Wealthy”

“Blacks do not have wealth to donate and are the recipients of philanthropy (charity). Black Philanthropy does NOT exist.”

“When Blacks do give, it’s mostly to the church and/or religious institutions.”

“Black philanthropists support economic equity, higher education, and health equity.”

“Our community has a significant population of wealthy blacks who give generously.”

“Black philanthropists understand our community’s needs and how to invest in our assets.”

“Giving Black is allows us to resist the negative narrative and view ourselves in relationship to our assets.”
Giving Black Cincinnati: Resiliency

Giving Black allows us to view our giving legacy historically and into the present.

“Black Philanthropy is not new but has deep roots in our community stemming from our earliest history here.”

“New awareness about Black Giving creates opportunity for stewardship.”

“Creating transparency on Black Giving was previously reported anonymously.”
Giving Black Cincinnati: Renewal

Linked Philanthropic Equity™
allows us to approach philanthropy with a renewed perspective

Developed by NEBiP, Linked Philanthropic Equity is an approach to philanthropic research and practice that:

Integrates essential constructs from social sciences to describe and explain philanthropic equity in general and across diverse communities

Draws upon multi-method, multi-disciplinary and iterative research as necessary to support both descriptive and prescriptive investigations around philanthropic giving

Is used to develop effective tools, strategies and community-level programming for donors and grant-making institutions
A Legacy of Black Resistance & Stewardship

Black Affinity Survey
Survey that examines the distinct interests and perceptions of self-identified Black Cincinnatians across age, education and economic levels, gender identities, and zip code.

Interviews & Focus Groups
1:1 interviews and group discussions to draw out insights and clarify nuances in Black giving behaviors and ideas.

A New Narrative
Expert analysis of empirical research within a framework of Linked Philanthropic Equity to draw out a new narrative for 21st Century Philanthropy in the Greater Cincinnati region.

Lens on behaviors and perspectives on Blacks in the region.
Insight to fuel social equity programming.
Platform for National Benchmarking Database.
Community stability and prosperity is best achieved when energy and resources are targeted.

Linked Philanthropic Equity™

All individuals across these communities are both interdependent and socially responsible to one another.
Black Cincinnatians have a deeply rooted and rich philanthropic history that demonstrates their resilience to structures that have intended to disenfranchise, their skills of resilience to overcome and persist, and their assets of stewardship that are often untapped/unrecognized by mainstream philanthropy.

*Giving Black: Cincinnati, A Legacy of Black Resistance and Stewardship* sets the stage to do this work.

- It celebrates and edifies these assets.
- It also requires the sector to examine its understanding and practices around the intersectionality of race and equity to shift the narrative.
- Donors view themselves as integral actors in ensuring the value of human interdependence
Summary of Data and Methods

57% Married
25% Single/Never Married

Zip Codes
Middle and Upper Middle Class Communities: Clifton and Paddock Hills, Evanston and Hyde Park, Northgate and Sharonville neighborhoods

16% Millennials
38% Gen X
38% Baby Boomers
37% Male
62% Female

1% Trans

Quantitative (N=307)
Summary of Data and Methods

Combined, Associates degree, HS/GED or did not complete HS

- 8%
- 91% Bachelor’s or higher

Self-employed

- 14%
- 16% Retired

Full-time Employees

- 60%

52% $80K to $249,9K annually

- 31% Less than $80K
- 30% Between $80K and up to $160K
- 22% Between $160K and up to $250K
- 17% Greater than $250K

Quantitative (N=307)
Summary of Data and Methods

**Resistence & Stewardship**

- **4 Focus Groups**
  
  (avg. 5-7 ppl)

- **60% Male**
  
  40% Female

- **50% earned Master’s or Professional Degree**
  
  100% earned Bachelor’s degree or higher

- **(15) 90-minute 1-1 Interviews**

- **Majority Baby Boomers**

  Few in early 30s to mid-40s (Millennials and Generation X)

Quantitative (N=42)

Participants self-identifying as High net worth (incomes >$100K)
Data confirms 3 Donor Motivational Types are present

“Giving back” and “Making a difference” and are Impact-driven (eradicate social problems)

Donors seeking to develop a particular strategy for their giving can compare their own personal commitments with answers to three questions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>QUESTION</th>
<th>CORNERSTONE</th>
<th>KINSHIP</th>
<th>SANCTIFIED</th>
<th>OTHER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What motivates your desire to give money?</td>
<td>General betterment of society</td>
<td>Empowering the Black community (or a subset of the Black community)</td>
<td>Living out my faith</td>
<td>Creating a personal legacy; teaching my children it's important; etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Would you prefer to develop expertise in a single sector (e.g., the arts or health) or would you prefer to give to multiple sectors?</td>
<td>One sector (two if part of a couple), multiple organizations in that sector</td>
<td>One community, multiple sectors to help that community</td>
<td>Give to a trusted religious institution for their use as they see fit.</td>
<td>Children's school or sports team fundraising; almamater only, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is it important that donating your time get factored into how much money you can give?</td>
<td>Yes - I am getting to the point where my time is more precious than my money.</td>
<td>My time and money are equally valuable - whatever the community needs, I'm in.</td>
<td>I do what is asked of me by the guidelines of my faith and/or religious institution.</td>
<td>My time is given instead of my money at this point in my life.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Major Research Findings: Theme 1

91% $80K+ Cornerstone and Kinship Donation Destination

68% spend time engaged in Community Service, Volunteerism & Mentorship that “make a difference”
Also affinity groups (Greek Organizations) and political campaigns (33% <$80K and Millennials)

Sanctified giving is key to early giving experiences
60% believe Black Cincinnati churches generate the most financial support

100% give heavily to church despite only half attend < $80K give to churches and family while higher income donors give to churches, educational institutions (alma maters, HBCUs) and direct service agencies (NAACP and the Urban League)
Most “Top-of-Mind” Important Issues by Income

Q5 - What are the three most important issues facing Black people in Cincinnati?
Open-Response Coding – Percent Selected
Sorted by Overall

- Economics/Poverty
- Segregation/Race Issues
- Education
- Employment
- Safety/Police
- Health
- Housing
- Other

Higher income respondents placed higher importance on “economics” and “segregation/race”

Black Giving is also Policy Specific
Trends differ by Gender, Income and Neighborhood

Economic Equity & Segregation/Race ($120K+)
Education & Employment (<$80K)

Most believe Economic Equity is an issue overlooked by the Cincinnati Philanthropic community, with 77% residents in eastern neighborhoods believe this to be true.
Black Giving is also Policy Specific
Trends differ by Gender, Income and Neighborhood

Black donors have high confidence in nonprofit and affinity organizations that solve or remediate local, regional and national problems that grossly impact people of African descent.

Black male donors ($120K-250K) give primarily to churches and organizations that focus on issues or causes that interests them, such as education, criminal justice reform, (i.e., GCF’s African American Fund).

71% of Black donors ($200K+) also spend more time volunteering for activities that are not specific to the Black community.

Regardless of income, Black female donors give primarily to family and tend to support organizations that focus on issues related to women, children, health, and education.
Black Donors want Clear, Transparent Donor Metrics, Education and Increased Philanthropic Opportunities

**Concerns around Measuring Donor Impact**
when giving to large, traditional nonprofits, local charities and regional foundations, is measured.

**Black donors monitor or evaluate their own giving by using an advisor**
Many have a plan, in the process of developing a plan or have an interest in establishing donor advised funds and giving vehicles.

Many also expressed the need for more donor education that are specific to their giving values and practices.
Major Research Findings: Theme 3

Black Donors want Clear, Transparent Donor Metrics, Education and Increased Philanthropic Opportunities

As expected, the higher the income and the older the respondent, the higher correlation to having a plan for wealth inheritance.

Millennials expressed the need for increased philanthropic opportunities
Perceptions of “Overall Wellbeing Connected to Other Blacks Doing Well” Differ by Income, Neighborhood and Age

11% of Black donors believe Cincinnati is a place of economic opportunity for Blacks to thrive

- Lack of trust between communities of color and mainstream philanthropic efforts
- Donors feel PWIs do not have the interest or ability to engage Black donors (Distortion effect)

48% believe the Cincinnati Collaborative Agreement has “somewhat” improved the quality of life for Blacks

- 33% didn’t know about the Agreement or had no opinion
- 19% believed the Agreement didn’t improve life for Blacks.
Perceptions of “Overall Wellbeing Connected to Other Blacks Doing Well” differ by Income, Neighborhood and Age

Respondents with higher annual household incomes perceived their overall well-being to be less dependent on “Blacks also doing well”

Compared to Black donors with incomes <$80K and those who reside in the north and eastern neighborhoods (“One City, Two Realities”)
Intra-dependence wanes; increase beliefs in meritocracy and individualism. Contributions are framed as “charity”

Lack of a unified “Black Agenda” or cohesion across generations.

Millennials and Generation X are frustrated with the “old guard”

Perceptions of “Overall Wellbeing Connected to Other Blacks Doing Well” differ by income, neighborhood and age
Shift away from the predominant narrative and embrace evidence that Black philanthropy does exist.

**Interdependence**

**Shift the paradigm from deficits to assets.**

**Prosperity**

Help curate new, inclusive language when defining “philanthropy,” what it is and what it looks like.

- By race/ethnicity and by generation

**Interdependence + Prosperity**

Leverage the economic power and interests of Black donors generally, and specifically high net worth donors.

**Interdependence + Prosperity**
9 Research Recommendations

5 Develop Transparent Impact Metrics of Donor Contribution. Responsible Stewardship

6 Black donor education resources and training.

7 Cultivate philanthropic networking opportunities that lead to Black donor pipeline and deeper, philanthropic contributions.

8 Develop programs that strengthen the relationship between the philanthropic sector, community stakeholders and Black donors. Responsible Stewardship

9 Effectively engage Generation X and Millennial Black donors. Interdependence + Prosperity
Next Steps

CALL TO ACTION

Fora for Black Voices

Race & Equity Roundtables & Workshops

Ambassador Trainings on Race & Equity